

Action Plans -

5a Rail Action Plan: Report on Consultation

- Purpose of Report

The purpose of this report is to update members on the responses received regarding the First Discussion Draft on the Rail Action Plan.

- Background

At its meeting on 8 February 2010, the Board agreed to publicise and distribute a First Discussion Draft of a Rail Action Plan.

This was conducted by distributing to all members of the North East Transport Consultative Forum, MPs and MSPs and other stakeholders including all Councillors from both local authorities. Local newspapers also picked up on the discussion draft and ran a number of articles relating to rail issues during the period of consultation.

- Responses

In total, some 27 responses have been received, mostly welcoming the draft and suggesting ways of enhancing rail travel to, from and within the north east.

A summary of responses has been prepared, indicating some 116 points and suggesting amendments to the Action Plan to take account of those responses which are valid in helping to further the actions proposed.

It is suggested that an amended version could then form the basis of informed discussion with the rail industry at a meeting to be held in the summer. The purpose of the meeting would be to try to encourage a co-operation between Nestrans, the local authorities, Transport Scotland, Network Rail and operators in taking forward a plan which incorporated shared vision and priorities, recognising that these partners may have different opinions but acknowledging where agreed objectives could be achieved.

- Recommendation

It is recommended that the Board

1. approve this report as the result of consultation on the First Discussion Draft,
2. agree to an officer-level meeting being held with the rail industry to seek common objectives in taking forward a Rail Action Plan, and
3. instruct that a final Rail Action Plan be brought back to a future meeting for approval thereafter.

RD/01 June 2010

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Deletion of some stops Aberdeen – Edinburgh/Glasgow services	Delete Inverkeithing/Kirkcaldy to speed up East Coast schedule	See below regarding Eureka proposals.	
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Stonehaven	Pleased to see Stonehaven identified as second tier station with Dyce and Inverurie. Lack of stops – between 0839 and 1009 no service to Edinburgh and gaps up to 2 hours to Glasgow. Justifies hourly service and would barely add any time.	Support noted.	
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Stonehaven car parking	Agree with comments re need for more parking at Stonehaven. Drainage/flooding issues in car park.	Noted.	
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Laurencekirk	Good news regarding success but deletion of stops elsewhere has disadvantaged users.	Noted.	
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	East Coast timetable	Lack of reference to EC Eureka proposals – issue of timings in Edinburgh and in Haymarket Tunnel. No benefit to times on Edinburgh-Aberdeen section. 1000 departure from London Kings Cross leaves Edinburgh at 1430, when later departure would spread times better.	Noted. Nestrans will respond to the Eureka proposals and include the key issues within the revised Rail Action Plan.	Include comment and details of Eureka proposals.
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Rail Forum	Interested, but unable to spare time		
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Rolling stock	ScotRail rolling stock does not compare favourably with overseas examples, notably conventional lines in Japan. Turbostars are tired and cramped.	Noted.	Add action and text relating to ensuring quality of rolling stock.
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Overcrowding	Overcrowding is an issue north of Edinburgh and north of Dundee at peak times.	Noted.	
1.	Dr Peter Smart Maryculter	Incidents	Abandoning services north of Edinburgh when affected by unusual weather or other	Agreed. Nestrans lobbies ministers and train	Add text relating to need to ensure that the north east

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			incidents reflects badly on companies and alienates travellers	operators to fulfil their obligations to the north east.	gets a fair response if incidents or inclement weather necessitate emergency timetables.
2.	Cllr Fiona McRae Peterhead	General	Support the ideas being put forward in principle	Support noted.	
2.	Cllr Fiona McRae Peterhead	Formartine Way	The whole north east is severely disadvantaged by lack of a rail line. Despite costs, the issue of carbon footprinting should also be considered.	Carbon footprinting would be taken into account in any assessment of new rail lines, but is unlikely to change the conclusion that reopening the line to Peterhead/Fraserburgh is unlikely to achieve benefits which justify the costs.	
2.	Cllr Fiona McRae Peterhead	Connecting bus routes	Bus routes in rural areas have been decimated especially for those in rural villages. Lack of information and availability of interconnecting tickets.	Noted – the proposals for integrated ticketing and information should help to alleviate some of these difficulties.	
3.	John Yellowlees First ScotRail	Current Rail Network	The defining characteristic of the north east's rail network is the legacy from the Beeching era, single tracking Aberdeen to Keith except for a short section. Limitation that trains can cross only at loops or stations.	Noted. The limitations on this route are a constraint and need to be taken into account in the Transport Scotland/Network Rail study to improve journey times and frequencies on this route.	
4.	Cllr Ian Tait Fraserburgh	Aberdeen-Fraserburgh	The economy of Fraserburgh desperately needs all the support it can get and the reinstatement of a rail link between Aberdeen and Fraserburgh would assist that	Noted. The former Formartine & Buchan line extended to Fraserburgh as well as Peterhead.	Amend section on "Potential for Line Reopenings" to include Fraserburgh.

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			greatly. Not mentioned in consultation document and should be included in the plan.		
4.	Cllr Ian Tait Fraserburgh	Rail Forum	Would be interested in being involved in a North East Rail		
5.	Cllr Ian Mollison, North Kincardine	General	This is an excellent document. Thank you for the opportunity to comment.	Noted.	
5.	Cllr Ian Mollison, North Kincardine	Portlethen	Like to see Nestrans push for more trains calling at Portlethen (six in each direction is not enough).	Support noted.	
5.	Cllr Ian Mollison, North Kincardine	Newtonhill	Like to see Nestrans push for the reinstatement of Newtonhill station. Supportive of the target to open a railway station in the north east every three years.	Newtonhill is likely to be the next station on the incremental list of station reopenings, depending on the progress and success of Kintore. However, need to recognise constrained site available at Newtonhill and difficulties in stopping trains on East Coast Main Line.	
5.	Cllr Ian Mollison, North Kincardine	CrossRail	Support the CrossRail concept wholeheartedly. Laurencekirk is a success and Kintore will be well used if and when it opens. Optimistic that the incremental approach to implementing CrossRail will eventually pay off.	Support noted.	
6.		catering	Note that catering is only available on 7 of daily services between Aberdeen and Inverness – none before 1014. Need to have catering on all long distance journeys, particularly at times when passengers are	Supported.	Add action to encourage operators to provide catering on all services to/from Aberdeen of 30 minutes or more duration.

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			likely to require refreshments, such as early morning.		
7.	Press & Journal 8 March 2010	Ticketing anomalies	Rail ticketing system confusing and illogical. Ticket prices do not reflect busiest trains, distance travelled and many fares are only available from certain stations. Need for simpler, fairer and more targeted ticketing structure to manage demand.	Supported. This has been raised with operators and Scottish ministers by Nestrans.	Strengthen section on ticketing to reflect these concerns.
7.	Press & Journal 8 March 2010	Caledonian Sleeper	Cheapest Sleeper tickets are being bought up by travel operators and ordinary passengers are not able to purchase directly.	Noted. This will be raised with ScotRail.	
8.	Cllr Graeme Clark, Stonehaven and Lower Deeside	Rail Forum	Very interested in being part of a North east Rail Forum.	Noted.	
9.	Airport Users Consultative Committee	Dyce station	Support any case made for improvements to Dyce station, especially to ensure that it is staffed at peak times, its waiting areas and parking and to the frequency and destinations of services to and from Dyce, in support of the airport's surface transport strategy to encourage more passengers away from "kiss and fly" and own car journeys.	Support noted.	
10	Cllr Rob Merson, Ellon and District	Line re-openings	Express disappointment in the passage which addresses the potential for line re-openings. Calls for re-openings are not "in the past" but current and will become more emphatic.	Noted. Wording should reflect the current desire for line re-openings to be considered.	Amend text to reflect the desire of some communities for line re-openings to be considered.
10	Cllr Rob Merson, Ellon	Rail Forum	Very interested in participating in a North East Rail Forum	Noted.	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
	and District				
10	Cllr Rob Merson, Ellon and District	Buchan rail link	Whilst there may not be an economic case for re-opening the Buchan line in today's terms, this situation will change much sooner than anticipated. "Peak oil" and price of petrol will cause exponential growth in road costs.	Agreed. The Plan indicates a proposal to protect former alignments with a view that the economic position will change in future.	
10	Cllr Rob Merson, Ellon and District	Protecting former rail lines	Rail Action Plan singularly fails to adequately address the matter of forward planning for the provision of an enhanced rail network for the north east. Aberdeenshire Council position of "former rail alignments will continue to be preserved as transport corridors" – Plan should reflect that policy.	Nestrans' Rail Action Plan covers the whole of Aberdeen City and Shire – there are parts of the former rail lines which are no longer in situ as transport corridors and it is therefore not possible to reflect the strength of the Aberdeenshire policy for the whole region.	
10	Cllr Rob Merson, Ellon and District	Ellon	Former rail yard at Ellon should be protected, or at least a line through the site for future transport corridor.	Specific sites are primarily a matter for the Local Development Plan, but such a safeguard would be consistent with the principle contained in the Regional Transport Strategy and Rail Action Plan.	
10	Cllr Rob Merson, Ellon and District	Longer term	Need to start planning for the provision of a future rail network now by identifying the optimum track routes and station sites so that they may be protected from unsuitable development. The starting point for this should be the Rail Action Plan.	Noted.	Add an action to progress the planning of future alignments and station sites so that these can be adequately protected to prevent developments which would

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
					prevent their future use as transport corridors.
11	Evening Express 1 March	Line re-openings	A rail link to Ellon could make a huge contribution towards alleviating traffic chaos at the Bridge of Don and be far better for the planet.	Noted.	
11	Evening Express 1 March	Line re-openings	Re-opening the Formartine & Buchan line would enable freight travelling to Peterhead and Fraserburgh to go by rail.	Noted.	
12	Planning for Real Event – Newtonhill, Muchals and Cammachmore	Newtonhill station	Press for reopening of station at Newtonhill as part of CrossRail scheme	Noted.	
13	Press and Journal 12 March 2010	High Speed Rail	Lord Adonis indicated that he had not ruled out the possibility of high speed trains operating to/from Aberdeen. The journey time from the north east could be expected to fall to around 6½ hours.	Noted.	Review text to include reference to the possibility of high speed trains to Aberdeen, albeit using conventional track for part of the journey.
14	Freight Transport association	General	Grateful for the opportunity to comment. A welcome and helpful initiative which is supported.	Noted	
14	Freight Transport association	Freight	FTA supports the growth of rail freight, which must be affordable, accessible, resilient, flexible and reliable. Costs must at least be comparable with road. Rail network must be available to freight seven days a week and overnight, particularly for retailers.	Noted.	
14	Freight Transport association	Gauge	Inability to get 9'6" high intermodal containers to Aberdeen without specialised low platform wagons, but lack of available wagons due to cost of equipment.	Noted.	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			Assistance in funding additional wagons would be more cost effective than gauge enhancement.		
14	Freight Transport association	High Speed Rail	HSR must not impact on capacity or service levels for freight on the existing network and need for adequate capacity for growth of rail freight.	Accepted.	
15	Cllr Jill Webster	High Speed Rail	Text should mention the possibility of dual-fuelled trains and consider the implications of proposed electrification on development.	Accepted.	Amend text to clarify the opportunities for the north east to take advantage of HSR, either by dual-fuelled trains or by ensuring electrification programme fits with timescales for developing HSR.
15	Cllr Jill Webster	Newtonhill	Need more emphasis on opportunity for station at Newtonhill, particularly in light of Area Committee's preferred option for development at Elsick.	Noted.	
15	Cllr Jill Webster	Modelling/projections	Experience on passenger growth demonstrates that the Government models are misguided. Better projections are required to identify opportunities for rail development in the north east	Agreed	Amend text to reflect this and add action to press Transport Scotland, Scottish Government and Network Rail to change their projections and models to more accurately reflect the experience of the benefits of rail developments in the north east.
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	general	SAPT fully support Nestrans' aspirations and are keen to ensure rail improvements in the north east get higher priority now. A well researched and realistic document.	Support noted.	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	integration	Co-ordination of bus and rail timetables would bring new travel opportunities. Recommend co-operation with Hitrans and Tactran, Councils, business groups and the general public to make the case for transport integration and rail improvements. Dyce, Inverurie and Huntly have good opportunities.	Noted and agreed. Nestrans will seek to deliver integrated timetables and improved information in partnership where possible.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Inter City	Regular clock-face hourly services from Aberdeen to Inverness as well as Edinburgh and Glasgow are essential. Increased usage of Aberdeen-Inverness line underline the urgent need to provide upgrades necessary by December 2012.		
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Quality partnership	Nestrans should consider Quality Partnership mechanism to develop a bus/rail and DRT co-ordination strategy, including through tickets.	Nestrans is already involved in a Quality partnership with the two Councils and two major bus operators in the area. Integrated through bus/rail tickets are available within Aberdeen (through PlusBus) and on the Buchan and Deeside corridors (RailBus scheme).	Amend text to better reflect the partnership working and the integrated ticketing opportunities which exist.
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Concessionary Travel	Scheme should be reviewed with the Government. Local journeys could be included, while free long distance bus journeys could be limited to cap costs.	This is a matter for the Scottish Government review and wider issue than the rail Action Plan. The discussion draft does contain reference to the possibility of a local rail	Add action to consider in conjunction with local authorities and operators the possibility of introducing a rail element to the concessionary travel scheme.

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
				concession scheme.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Fares/Parking charges	Fare levels and city parking charges should encourage modal shift from cars.	Noted.	Add reference to the importance of parking constraints in town and city centres if we are to achieve modal shift.
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Station stops	Acknowledge need to balance faster end-to-end journey times with intermediate station stops. This does not rule out regular calling patterns, even at less busy stations.	Noted.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Stonehaven	Should have a regular twice-hourly service	Agreed	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Portlethen	As a tertiary station, should have trains every two hours with additional calls as necessary at peak times.	Noted	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Laurencekirk	As a tertiary station, should have trains every two hours with additional calls as necessary at peak times.	Noted	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Car Parking	Station car parks are essential in a largely rural area with a limited rail network. Park and Ride should be concentrated on existing or new stations rather than "out of town".	Noted	CrossRail
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	CrossRail	Agree that focussing on extending existing trains from the south across Aberdeen to Dyce and Inverurie is the most realistic way of delivering a cross-Aberdeen service.	Noted.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Line Re-openings	Support preserving former rail alignments as transport corridors. The Deeside and Peterhead/Fraserburgh lines should be	Noted.	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
	Transport		protected from any developments that could prevent future re-use for rail or light rail. A spur route from south of Dyce into Aberdeen Airport should also be protected. Disappointed that the Plan considers rail extensions "hugely expensive" – light rail trams should be considered and likely to be less expensive than road building. Tram/train service to Aberdeen Airport and Banchory by December 2020		
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	High Speed Rail	Welcome references to Anglo-Scottish HSR. This re-enforces the need to ensure that Aberdeen-Edinburgh/Glasgow rail routes are included in Scottish rail electrification plans.	Agreed.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Sleeper services	Need to maintain overnight Aberdeen-London sleeper. Rolling stock is increasingly obsolescent but continues to serve a useful function.	Agreed.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Phasing	Agree need for realistic phased timetable for improvements.	Noted.	
16	Scottish Association for Public Transport	Kintore	Aim to reopen station by December 2012	Noted, but it is felt that a more realistic timescale might be 2014.	Include target date in action relating to Kintore station reopening.
17	Grampian Racial Equality Council	Information	Basic information should be available in key community languages.	Noted.	Ensure translation services are offered and documents are accessibility as appropriate.
17	Grampian Racial Equality Council	fares	Economic migrants find the cost of public transport prohibitive.	Noted. Fares in general are included in the draft as an important issue.	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
17	Grampian Racial Equality Council	Access for all	Encouraged at recognition of the need for access for all. However, need to also recognise sensory impairments as well as physical disabilities. Technological advances could ensure a fully integrated and accessible system for people with a range of disabilities, including email, SMS and text alerts.	Noted.	Amend text to reflect this issue.
17	Grampian Racial Equality Council	Access to Aberdeen station/bus station	Aware of concerns raised by Civic Forum in relation to problems of access to Aberdeen station and bus station. To be considered by a Civic Forum Working Group.	Noted. However, the rail Action Ploan is a strategic document and details of design, access and traffic are appropriately dealt with by Aberdeen City Council and operators.	
18	First ScotRail	information	North east specific timetable information must make it clear that the timetable is a national product.		
18	First ScotRail	Rail Forum	Look forward to attending a North East Scotland Rail Forum focused on delivery of projects.	Noted.	
18	First ScotRail	Access for all	Difficulties at Inch are well-known.		
18	First ScotRail	Car parking	Car park management is subject to the outcome of Transport Scotland's recent review of station car parking. Opportunity at Inverurie to develop additional parking within the station lease area, with partnership funding.	Noted.	
18	First ScotRail	Stonehaven	Later this year, ScotRail will provide an interchange shelter. Calling all trains would impact on journey times and on line occupancy of single-track sections.	Noted.	Include within text.
18	First ScotRail	Dyce	Feasibility study commissioned to consider	Noted. Nestrans have	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			expansion of car park to allow for the creation of a bus turning circle, taxi waiting area, ticket office and staff accommodation along with improved traffic management.	offered to contribute to the assessment.	
18	First ScotRail	Integration	Opportunity to establish through ticket to Aberdeen Airport.	Noted. Nestrans will work with Aberdeen City Council and ScotRail to facilitate this opportunity.	
18	First ScotRail	Portlethen	Passenger numbers at Portlethen do not justify provision of CCTV without partnership funding to cover the running costs for the remainder of the franchise. Increasing the number of calls would run counter to Transport Scotland's concern about maintaining end-to-end journey times.		
18	First ScotRail	Ticketing	There are no plans to install Ticket Machines at any further stations.		
18	First ScotRail	Fares	Cheapest discounted tickets are only available between main stations, but an add-on can cover the additional leg from or to a local station.		
18	First ScotRail	Stopping patterns	Tactran's Tay Estuary Rail Study proposals could allow deletion of some calls in Aberdeen-Glasgow services.	So would this allow for additional stops at Stonehaven and Portlethen?	
18	First ScotRail	Aberdeen-Inverness	Transport Scotland has called into question the affordability of additional Sunday services.		
18	First ScotRail	Aberdeen-Inverness	Significant enhancement will be required between Aberdeen and Inverurie to provide reinstatement of double track to enable a reliable service.		
18	First ScotRail	Kintore	Station at Inverness Airport has been		

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			rejected by Transport Scotland without provision of a passing loop and the same logic would seem applicable at Kintore.		
19	Tactran	general	Tactran supports the actions contained in the Plan as these will benefit passengers travelling between the two regions.	Support noted.	
19	Tactran	Stonehaven	Tactran would support additional stops at Stonehaven so long as it does not affect the stopping pattern of trains in the Tactran region.	Noted.	
19	Tactran	Stopping patterns	Proposed recast of Aberdeen-Glasgow service and solution to line constraints at Usan require Nestrans and Tactran to work together to maximise benefits to travelling public in both regions. Longer-term aspirations for Tay Estuary Study should also be considered.	Agreed. It will be essential that proposals are fully consulted and agreed between the partnerships.	
19	Tactran	Rail Forum	Tactran would wish to be involved at officer level.	Noted.	
19	Tactran	High Speed Rail	Continue to work together to ensure that the benefits of faster train services are achieved, whether through an extension of HSR to Aberdeen or ensuring that through trains to London make effective use of the proposed line in conjunction with STPR improvements.	Noted.	
20	Transport Scotland	Aberdeen-Inverness	Welcome commitment to work with Transport Scotland and Network Rail on Aberdeen-Inverness line improvements to achieve journey time and service frequency aspirations.	Noted, Nestrans has already met with Transport Scotland and Network Rail and is pleased to continue to contribute to the work as appropriate.	
20	Transport	Usan	Note desire to find a solution, this will be		

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
	Scotland		considered during feasibility work associated with the Aberdeen-Central Belt project.		
20	Transport Scotland	Electrification	Phases 4 and 5 are long-term and as such have no plans to develop these projects further at this stage. There are no plans to electrify Aberdeen-Inverness.		
20	Transport Scotland	Car Parking	Transport Scotland is developing a car parking policy. Following completion, we would expect to work with Nestrans in implementing it.		
20	Transport Scotland	New rail lines	The STPR has set out our long term plans for rail in Scotland. We do not expect any other significant new proposals to be developed.		
20	Transport Scotland	New stations	Other than those set out in the STPR, we have no plans for new stations.		
20	Transport Scotland	Station hierarchy	Not sure what is sought to be achieved as no link back to aims and objectives. Implication would seem to be an acceptance of fewer calls at Inch and Huntly.		Make link between aims and objectives to actions clearer. Consider appropriateness of some trains not calling at Huntly and Inch to facilitate faster end-to-end journey times as part of Aberdeen-Inverness enhancements.
20	Transport Scotland	Franchises	No mention of IEP/East Coast through trains. Opportunity to express views.		
20	Transport Scotland	General	The draft Plan is helpful in setting out Nestrans' aspirations. It will inform future High Level Output Statements (HLOS) and franchise specifications.		
21	BAA Aberdeen	General	The airport supports the aims and objectives of the Rail Action Plan and its aims to improve transport and travel choices in the		

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
			area.		
21	BAA Aberdeen	Dyce	Station developments should take account of the need for an integrated rail/bus shelter for users of the Dyce 80 Airlink shuttle bus. Station should be upgraded to make station fully compatible with DDA guidelines. Aberdeen Airport would like to suggest that the airport ground adjacent to the west rail platform be considered for development within any future station development plans.	Noted. Nestrans will bring this information to the attention of the consultant working on behalf of ScotRail regarding the station upgrade and Transport Scotland when they come to consider the DDA possibilities.	Clarify and expand text.
21	BAA Aberdeen	Integrated tickets	Would like to see integrated ticketing as an option for Dyce Airlink passengers along with train tickets.	Agreed.	Add as an action.
21	BAA Aberdeen	Cycling	Limited number of bicycle spaces makes it increasingly difficult for cyclists to ensure that they are guaranteed a space so may not make the journey by train. Increased provision for cyclists on board trains would contribute to the airport's objectives to increase public transport modal split.	Noted.	Add text to emphasise the importance of opportunities for bicycle carriage on trains – possible action to be added?
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	Freight	Freight issues should be referred to earlier in the document with clear links to the Freight Action Plan.	Noted.	Amend text to make clear reference to Freight Action Plan.
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	High Speed Rail	Indicate preliminary findings on cost:benefit analysis of extending HSR to Aberdeen and emphasise importance of line benefits to mitigate the investment focus in central belt to ensure north east is not disadvantaged.	Noted.	Add section expanding on HSR and most up-to-date position
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	Rail Forum	Include reference to two Councils	Noted	Add explicit reference to Aberdeen City Council and Aberdeenshire Council as key members of a Rail Forum.

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	Facilities	Thresholds should be identified by Network Rail	Noted, but the Rail Action Plan has identified a need for such facilities within the north east.	Amend action to focus on workingf with Network rail, ScotRail and others to identify appropriate thresholds for facilities in the north east
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	general	Not all actions are "SMART". Also most actions contain outputs, not outcomes. Need linking statement from actions to indicators/targets to identify what the outputs are intended to achieve.	Noted	Review all actions and targets to focus on SMART outputs with clear connections from actions to targets.
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	Long term actions	Need to indicate timescales	Noted	Clarify in final draft
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	Former railway lines	These already perform as transport corridors for walking and cycling. They should be protected so that if future benefits outweigh the negative impacts they could be considered for re-opening.	Agreed.	
22	Joanna Murray, Aberdeen City Council	monitoring	Opportunity to update to take account of Nestrans 2009 monitoring report.	Noted.	Update and include most up-to-date information.
23	Ellon Advertiser, 26 February 2010	Formartine & Buchan line	Pleased to see that reopening the rail line to Peterhead is creeping up the agenda. The massive increase in development along the Bridge of Don to Peterhead corridor needs investment to match. Need serious planning for reopening the rail line north.	Noted.	Add action to progress options.
23	Ellon Advertiser, 26 February 2010	Formartine & Buchan line	The Energetica concept needs to be supported by serious investment in the infrastructure. Simply preserving the route is not sufficient.	Noted.	
24	Advertiser	CrossRail	The phenomenal success in the number of	The Rail Action Plan looks	

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
	Series/Inverurie Herald – Westminster Word by Malcolm Bruce		people using trains in the north east should persuade the Government of the case for backing CrossRail commuter link from Inverurie to Stonehaven.	to develop CrossRail on an incremental basis by implementing those elements which perform best first, in the hope that this can be built upon towards an improved cross-Aberdeen service.	
24	Advertiser Series/Inverurie Herald – Westminster Word by Malcolm Bruce	Sunday services	Campaigned for extra trains and stations and improved Sunday services.	Nestrans has put forward a proposal to Transport Scotland for additional Sunday services on the Aberdeen-Inverness line, but this has not been accepted as increased revenue may not exceed costs.	
24	Advertiser Series/Inverurie Herald – Westminster Word by Malcolm Bruce	Kintore	Need to embrace the case for a new station at Kintore.	Agreed.	
24	Advertiser Series/Inverurie Herald – Westminster Word by Malcolm Bruce	Forecasts	Transport Scotland are using unrealistically low forecasts of usage. Rail represents a valuable investment which eases road congestion and pollution.	Agreed – Laurencekirk station is performing approximately 80% above forecast. Using realistic projections would change the economic case for new services and stations in the north east. Transport Scotland and DfT are currently investigating	Contribute to Transport Scotland/DfT review of forecasts as appropriate.

	Respondent	Topic	Summary of Comment	Nestrans' Response	Alteration to Rail Action Plan
				appropriate forecasts throughout the country.	
25	Press & Journal, 4 February 2010	Forecasts	Number of people using trains in the north east has soared by almost a third in just a few years.	Noted.	Include figures comparing growth in north east to nation-wide figures.
25	Press & Journal, 4 February 2010	Dyce station	ScotRail are conducting a feasibility study into Dyce to look at changing the layout of the car park, providing an improved bus stop, a designated taxi waiting area and extra car parking spaces as well as investigate the possibility of a staffed ticket office.	Noted. Nestrans will communicate with the consultants to seek improved facilities and the optimum solution for the north east's second busiest station.	Amend text to reflect this ongoing work.
26	Passenger Focus	Rail Forum	Welcome the opportunity to participate in a North East Rail Forum. It is important that the voice of rail users is heard and listened to.	Noted	
26	Passenger Focus	Station issues	Facilities depend on a stations' size and location. Some facilities are a common need for all passengers – such as real time information. A matrix of needs and features has been developed.	Noted	
26	Passenger Focus	Car parking demand/ supply	The ad-hoc nature of parking policy makes a consistent policy difficult. A lack of parking spaces can suppress overall demand for rail travel. Car parking charges need to be seen to be fair, although making a charge redeemable against ticket costs may help ensure spaces for rail users.	Noted	
26	Passenger Focus	Fares	Concern at complexity of fares structure and working to develop simplification of ticketing.	Noted.	
27	Graham Lund	Reopening of stations	Multiple reopening of stations should be considered. Traffic far too heavy, notably on Union Street.	Noted.	

RD
20 April 2010